

Fostering Sustainable Behavior Workshop Notes

Resources

Contact Doug McKenzie-Moore dmm@cbsm.com

Website www.cbsm.com

- articles, case studies, strategies, and discussion
- Flash files with strategies relevant to your particular interests, covers a broad range of behavioral interests
 - Fostering Sustainable behavior list-serv, archived on website.- will switch over to online discussion forums about specific interest areas.
 - Strategies document portions of the site- 15 so far, looking at particular behavior changes, tells about best programs (look at for recycling)
 - Each paper has its own discussion forum, so that you can connect with the community around the world working on that particular piece of the sustainability puzzle, making the papers living documents

Day 1 of Workshop

Why do we continue to work on advertising campaigns that do not effectuate behavior change?

- Underestimate difficulty
- Expediency
- Ineffective models- should be going to environmental Psychologists, not marketers
- Lack of evaluations- tend to evaluate outputs (brochures) rather than outcomes (measurable changes in behavior), looking at checklists rather than what you really accomplished- changes in behavior, resource use, resource quality
- Relative ease
- Fund people to deliver programs that will follow a good strategy, make sure the policy is in support of useful initiatives

Barriers and benefits might look unique to a specific initiative, see different sets of barriers for actions- need to understand what the context is that we select in the first step! Have to understand this first before developing a plan.

Have they taken the time to understand their audience well enough? Problem is that our own personal theories come into play rather than what may actually be happening. Design your program based on your own filters, if you are spending time and money- be responsible.

CBSM- Community Based Social Marketing

- Environmental Psychology
- Looking at blending together marketing and psychology
- Select behavior
- Uncover barriers and benefits
- Develop Strategy- increase benefits, reduce barriers, increase barriers from other activities that are not beneficial, reduce those perceived benefits.
- Pilot Strategy!!! Broad scale experiments are dangerous.
- Implement Broadly and Evaluate

Selecting Behaviors

- Policy change- whenever possible look at upstream solutions- raise café standards so that people have to make good choices at some level. Go after policy that changes the landscape of peoples options.
- Voluntary behavioral change with the understanding that this will lead to policy change. Garner public support that can push forward other initiatives to affect landscape of options.
- Voluntary compliance with existing regulations- policing existing regulations. Need high levels of compliance to actually get things done at some level- what programs can effectively create change.
- Strictly voluntary change

2 types of behaviors

- 1 time behavior change ex. House close to work. Low-flow toilet.
 - Whenever possible, go after these, a little harder to ditch out on or not follow through with continued benefits.
 - Rebound effects show that even when one time changes occur, people compensate. Ex. Efficient cars that encourage more driving.
- Repetitive behavior change. Change and then keep it going- sustain over time like recycling.
 - Is this change 1x or repetitive?

Selecting Behaviors

- Behaviors must not be divisible- sub behaviors have barriers associated with them, like buying an efficient fridge and then storing stuff in the old one still.

List Behaviors- need to be non-divisible, end state behaviors, meaning that you are listing the end goal first. Get directly to the most desirable outcome.

- Work out what the barriers are then put it into a plan

2- List potential impacts- list impacts before deciding what is most important

- Mapping out impact versus probability, look at combined value
- www.theclimateproject.org
- Assess multiple possibilities, gives more legit starting point
- Impacts are easier to map out, probabilities are harder, look at existing case studies in order to pull out data.
- Good idea to go after low impact and high probability projects because its almost a given that you can enhance sustainable behavior over time.
- When you can get people to engage in a set a behaviors it leads to a certain belief system
- The transition to a sustainable future will occur, how quickly will depend on how well we articulate that vision and articulate feedback- Paul Stern and Jerry Gardner. Environmental Values- environmental problems and human behavior, Allyn and bacon.

3- Uncovering Barriers-

- 1- Literature search- what do we know specifically about barriers and benefits right now.
 - Make sure to clarify mandate- need to know which actions to pursue.

- Review- trade magazines, gov. and non-gov reports, academic articles
- Speak to authors of reports to get material that was taken out! And connect into a community of learning
- Consult www.cbsm.com website for information- academic articles data bases, set up to track your interests
- 2- Observations
 - ex. 72% people drive around with under-inflated tires that decrease fuel efficiency by 15%.
 - Looking at behaviors, many times made up of sets of activities or actions that make up those behaviors.
 - Context
 - Unobtrusive Observations- is the behavior I'm interested in observable in a way that doesn't invade someones space
- 3- Focus Group research- not a group study session
 - Use literature review, create set of questions, 6-8 participants per focus group keeps it comfortable, 2 target audiences. People who have adopted a behavior change and those who have not. Do not mix. People who are not acting on things will be more honest about their behaviors. See handout.
 - Driving up participation rates by mailing out form to homes from respected individual or org, then follow up, did you receive the mailing? Personal invitation and why its important.
 - Ask people to write down responses, this allows for tracking how participants are actually responding and may change responses based on social pressures/interactions.
 - Want to learn everything you can from target audience, so its important that the process be carefully directed.
 - Any knowledge is better than no knowledge.
 - 50-60\$ typically for 1 hour of time per person. This money appeals to certain income bracket groups, so results may be skewed. So pay or make donation to charity of your choice to hopefully even out the participant pool.
 - Typically 5-6 thousand per focus group activity
 - 4 groupings- men and women, active in behavior or inactive.
 - Also offer raffle prize to draw in larger numbers of people
- 4- Survey research- based on best knowledge possible, last step
 - Idea of triangulation, hoping that all these methods uncover information about the barriers and benefits of the actions proposed
 - During the surveys last gives more potential to perform
 - Multi-various statistics to distinguish who is active in a behavior and who is not active. Descriptive statistics cannot tell you what is the most distinctive barrier, which is really useful information. Want to know which barrier is most important and which is the most relevant among slew of barriers.
 - Need at least 2 target groups, active and inactive. Equal sizes.
 - Need a minimum of 12-15 participants for each barrier and benefit.
 - Survey Types
 - Face to face interviews- highest participation rates, run longest survey. Expensive, time consuming.

- Telephone survey- cant be longer than 10 minutes. Less expensive and faster. Lower participation rates.
- Mail surveys- inexpensive, low participation rates, time consuming.
- Internet surveys- need good quality control, and what % of audience has internet access? Inexpensive, immediate data analysis.
- Intercept survey- go to places where people are ask a couple quick questions. Couple minutes at most. Make sure to survey in lots of different contexts. Get at what and why in terms of barriers and benefits.
- Refusal Survey- not interested. Is there another time that would be more convenient? No? Then I understand you don't want to participate in our 10-12 minute survey, we would like to know why you did not want to participate, could we take a few minutes? Short list of questions, behavior, belief, and demographics question. Hoping to find a few differences.

If programs are based on individual beliefs rather than a study of barriers and benefits, most likely end up with shoddy results.

Ex. Tire inflation barriers

- Time for maintenance and check ups
- Ignorance of requirements
- No tire gauge

Need to come up with some way for people to remember the issue, give them the tools to check, and make sure the maintenance is being performed.

Benefits

- Driving safely
- Preventing tire wear
- Fuel efficiency
-

In order to be a good social marketer, you have to set aside what you think you know, and learn more about how people actually respond. You have to carefully collect information and then decide what strategies to pursue. Once you evaluate behavior with its own set of barriers and benefits, then we can move forward effectively.

Developing Strategies

Specific behavior	Barriers	Benefits
Encourage	-	+
Discourage	+	-

Commitment

- Case study- idling.
 - 1) 8 versions of signs made to be seen at window height posted near locations. Signs didn't work alone.
 - 2) combined signs with personal appeals from others- hired a group of university students wearing official gear, what is said first is driven by the perceived benefits, we are working to get people to turn vehicles

off and not idle, give information that this will have no impact on your vehicle, would you be willing to turn your vehicle off when parked? Would you be willing to post a static cling sticker on the front windshield of your vehicle. *Designed to showcase a specific behavior and develop community norms.*

- *Behaviors people engage in translate oftentimes into a set of attitudes.*
- *Commitment ought to be public and durable*
- Increases the likelihood of these sorts of conversation *occurring*, find ways to create a social dialogue about these things.
- Voluntary behavior change programs, led to public support, policy implementation and enforcement.
- Making a commitment- putting your name on a list that is both public and durable- creating public norms and social diffusion.
- Measurements one year later, unobtrusive process
 - Put stickers on recycling containers, such as We Compost Too! Ask the person if you can have permission to put the sticker on their bin for them. Make sure that they have the recycling container out and there would be someone to apply the sticker on a certain day.
 - Another idea, making a booklet with pictures of a person, good things they are doing, contact details for a person. Creates opportunities for discussion, public recognition, can take one particular sector and showcase the information. Information posted on the internet? Signs near property.

Commitment techniques

- Avoid Coercion- when people voluntarily agree to do something, it is more engaging and consistent. People come to see themselves differently after having made a commitment as they make a choice and do it consistently.
- Call in. Request materials be sent with giving a pledge that they would make a donation if the materials are provided.
- Provide options, ask which they are interested in. request call backs to follow up.
- Make commitment public and durable.
- Promote involvement- people change their views of themselves based on small scale involvement
- Enhance self-perceptions- can you tell me what actions your household etc. has already engaged in to be environmentally friendly, what do you think you can do to expand that? Can we help?
- Facilitate social diffusion-
 - Ex. Study in Midwest usa, USDA interested in dealing with drought crisis, wait until spring to dig crops in. Spoke with farmers at county fairs, not working. Went into farming communities, asked them who the most well-respected farmer in the area. Went to that person, ask to showcase best practices there, then that figure was the person who could then influence that segment of the community.
 - Use of commitment with social diffusion- *identify people who are well-respected and well-known. They are more likely to be able to diffuse those behaviors.*
 - *Gain commitments that are public and durable, enhance likelihood of people talking about the behavior.*

- Commitments are more likely to be effective if they point to a specific behavior, a specific action.
- Focus on a class of behaviors, too many ideas overwhelm people.
- Use of incentives coupled with commitments, it changes the internal motives for wanting to change behavior. Like paying a kid to go to school. If using incentives for repetitive behavioral change, can be incredibly effective, but if the incentive is being used to motivate a behavior that people are intrinsically motivated to participate in, the long term success of the behavior can be impacted if the incentives ever are removed.

Prompts: not designed to change peoples attitudes, but for overcoming forgetting

- Needs to speak to a specific behavioral change, close in space and time to the change that its trying to encourage.
- Barrier benefit research- perceptions with recycled products
 - Price, quality
 - Locating, availability, cynicism
- Response to recycling issue was a multimodal program with posters and media. They passed off marketing materials to local companies etc and leveraged the costs in the community.
- Shelf toppers or prompts were widely employed, prompt right in front of a product
- Evaluated by looking at electronic inventory data for the actual products being advertised in stores. Compared before and after campaign to raise awareness of products with recycled content.
- Saw dramatic increases as a result of prompts, take info to manufacturers to encourage further increases of recycled products.
- One option is posting labels directly on environmentally friendly products, prompts are not always visible though.
- Assign environmental information on products bar codes. Can showcase this on the electronic boards on the stores, so working directly with the manufacturers etc. and cutting out all the work in the middle. Challenge is an agreement on the 3rd party verification labeling etc.

Traditional information approaches vs. community based social marketing

- Is there really a better return on investment?
- Case Study: Water and 3 communities in Toronto
- Focus on water efficiency or build more capacity
 - 500 homes/group, monitored flow meters for community, people did not know that they were being monitored because that can change the program.
 - Information intensive approach was 2 mailings over the summer informing people about
 - Other was taking students and others around to houses, ask people to make a public and durable commitment with a water sticker on front window. Not big enough to be viewed though. Also a prompt on water monitors.
 - Saw substantial decrease from staff going door to door. Is this cost effective? Evaluated by asking how much it would cost to build a new water treatment plant vs. efficiency. Can we offset doing that by more efficiency?

- Areas where social marketing was so effective, it actually made more sense to not build more capacity, but keep reduction in line.
- Maintain delivery of the program and still lock in results.
- Study found at cbsm Glen...

- prompts continued

- Shopping list note pad- Generic messages, include reminder to bring grocery bags, least waste packaging
- Monterey Bay Aquarium seafood list- based on color code, folds up to be the size of a credit card and kept in a wallet to provide more visibility for foods that are sustainability harvested.
- Put prompts to remind for paper towels, short showers, recycling bins, etc. Did look at numbers to measure impact. Made sure to provide people feedback once the numbers were in. Repetitive behavioral change.
- Cant assume something is effective unless some numbers have been collected.
 - Can prompt be used to get people to engage in behavioral change and that is now how they act or does the prompt become background noise?
 - Response cost of adopting a new behavior- what does that mean to the individual? How do we bridge over to what is viewed as a lifestyle change and adapting to the new process?
 - Ask, how long did it take for you to make the action comfortable? Make people to make commitments further on to check in to see how it is still going once the switch was made.

Prompts

- Should be noticeable
- Self-explanatory
- Close in space and time
- Encourage positive behavior
- Combine prompts with other tools ex. With a commitment

Norms

- These are social creations, hoping to develop new norms. We fail at developing new norms if they are not public and visible.
- Indicate behavior expected by others
 - Descriptive norm- based on other peoples actions
 - Injunctive norm- literally tell someone about their actions
- Looking at altering behaviors by combining prompts and norms, modeling positive behaviors. By repeatedly witnessing the same behavior, start to change in all circumstances.
 - Make it noticeable
 - Close in space in time to behavior you are trying to encourage
 - Encourage positive behavior

Communication

- Information intensive programs are not always the most effective
- Capturing peoples attention! Vivid messages are more likely to pull people in. Painting pictures that can relate more to people and are more likely to be

transferred into long term memory. Stories that connect with people in a vivid way and are more likely to be retrieved from memory as well.

- *Content in messages*
 - *avoid extreme messages*- people counter argue the message and move farther in the other direction.
 - Rearrange the costs versus the benefits and talk to people about other things that matter to them people will be more receptive. Things that benefit them or speak personally to them will be integrated more successfully.
 - Fearful messages? Showing a warning of what can happen unless action is taken on an issue
 - how to create collective advocacy when an individual action is primarily altruistically motivated, there is no direct benefit, how to provide people with aggregate information through the use of feedback
 - *Reinforces Repetitive Behavior*
 - "last week your street increased the number by ...% . Great work, thank you." Providing more feedback and visibility.
 - *Framing*- literature suggests that people are more worried about losing money by not acting or saving the same amount of money by acting. Better of talking about loss if no action is taking. (see website for info cbsm.com) "Cut your losses"
 - What is the *best medium* through which to deliver a message? Face to face contact, radio, tv, images. Least persuasive: newsprint, tv, radio, face to face. But complicated issues need printed material. So see double approach of reviewing material dropped off at home, receive a phone call or face to face limited contact. Make a pledge to review those materials. Would it be ok to do a follow up? Drive up the likelihood that there will be some behavioral change.
 - Creating new descriptive norms in the way that things are introduced, showcasing a problem can show all the wrong behaviors as being normative. Want to think about framing new norms that head people in a direction of thinking that good behavior is the norm. Email dmm@cbsm.com if you would like a copy of a journal article that studied this issue.
 - Idea of fostering more conversations that can lead to norms and behavior changes. Putting ideas out there for people to analyze and consider acting upon...

Developing and implementing a pilot

- *Pre-test, post-test design*- get baseline measurements and do them again after the pilot program. Have no way of knowing if its your program that changed the behavior. Often not definitive. Have at least 2 groups, randomly assign participants to each group.
- *Intervention and Control*- group that gets project, and group that gets the control. Random assignment before program is implemented. Looking for differences between final measurements.
- Don't have to focus on only 1 strategy
- Measure changes in behavior, resource use, and resource quality.

Don't assume you can skip a pilot, make sure it changes behavior and that there is a return on investment, that the idea is working, test out several strategies, then go on to broad scale interpretation.

Day 2

Selecting Behaviors

- Behaviors have to be non divisible and end state behaviors as guides for what we are aiming for
- Non-divisible: focuses on one specific behavior, doesn't have a bunch of subsets of actions associated ex. Reduce pesticide use- actions could include using organic alternatives, plant native species, raising height of lawn mower, aerating lawn, mulch cuttings.
- Breaking an activity down to its sub-activities- each of those behaviors have specific actions which has its own barriers
- Start with end state behaviors, think about barriers, then at the end look at strategies.
- Y axis- experts (technical studies), x axis- target audience (case studies), ratings sought individually then averaged together.
-

Practice case studies

Weed and Feed practices

Impacts- watershed quality, health of community

Scale of 1-5 impact ratings

Step 2- Barrier Benefit Research

- Literature search
 - Consult website
 - Organize at state and federal level to collect research around these actions. Ex. California integrated waste management board that collects information about barriers and benefits to specific actions, research coordinated at a state level. Done so that it can speak to variations in different regions, patterns, and various benefits.
- Observations
 - Think of these as overlapping in literature search
 - Be unobtrusive to make sure not to influence the behaviors you are trying to observe.
 - Activities vs. behaviors
- Focus groups
 - Want to talk with people who are engaged in the action as well as those who are not
 - Utilize literature and observations
 - Most important question is, given my audience, what is the best strategy to get the information needed to identify barriers and benefits,

thinking about the ability to generalize results and apply them to the larger community.

- Whenever possible want to put people in focus groups based on actions whether than reported actions. Issue in terms of how participants are selected- need to say, we know that most people are not engaged in this behavior. If you are not, we would like to learn more about what the barriers and benefits are, so that in the end, you get participants that are being set up to be as honest and frank as possible.
- Can run focus groups to review potential plans to see how effective a program would be. Can reveal issues around the plan, catch discrepancies, and test out which method is the most effective. Use the method that is accepted by the largest number of people. Also can be done through a pilot to a pilot... and followed up to check that focus group information may not be as informed as the strategy behind the plan.
- Refer to the Sage Focus Group Kit
- Surveys
 - In terms of developing a survey, unless specifically trained, don't do this yourself! Become a good consumer of survey research- make sure survey had been done well for you.
 - Survey Objective statement- one sentence describing purpose, stating behavior and the group. Can help to keep away from an overwhelming amount of information. Need a wa to scrutinize each of the elements to include
 - Need to create a list of items to potentially include in the survey- scrutinize each items against survey objective statement. Think about # questions, threshold of 10-12 minutes, can only look at 2-3 behaviors within that survey. Maybe 4-5 within a face to face interview. All closed-end questions to get the right kinds of statistics, open-ended for focus group research. These questions can be about 100, all scaled from likely to not, grouped questions. Worthwhile just to provide ends of scales. Ex. Scale 1-7, 1 is strongly agree, 7 is strongly disagree.
 - Develop survey
 - Pilot test the survey, no matter how great it seems. Looking for items that people are asking you to repeat and length of the survey.
 - Select the sample- have at least 2 target audiences, active and inactive, need roughly equal numbers. For each barrier and benefit, need 15 participants for multivarious statistics. Sample size needs to be stated up front in the development of the study, especially multivarious statistics.
 - Run survey as quickly as you can in order to limit outside events that could impact it.
 - Analyze results- is data legit?
 - Want to know how many called, and what % hung up before survey was offered...
 - Do a comparison between refusal survey and full survey, hoping for no significant differences
 - Survey kit by Sage also...

Timeline: around about 11 week process

Select behaviors: 1-2

Literature search: 1-4

Observations: 3-4

Focus Groups 5-7

Survey 7-11

Tools

- Commitment- voluntary, public, durable
- Social Diffusion
 - Identify well known and well respected people
 - Make peoples present action public and durable
- Prompts
 - Close in space and time and noticeable
- Norms
 - Showcase what people believe ought to happen, rather than what they are actually doing. So enforce beliefs even if the behaviors are not yet there.
- Communication
 - Make it vivid and noticeable, influential message deliverer to target audience- trustworthy and informed.
 - David Myers- central and peripheral routes to persuasion
- Incentives
 - For repetitive behavior, if removed at a later time, it can be detrimental to the program.
 - Need to be testing things that you can in fact implement at a broad scale, not worth the time to use something that is only workable during a pilot situation.
- Convenience
 - One of the most common barriers. Ex. Boulder, people didn't want to wait longer than 10 minutes, so implemented small busses based on convenience. Barrier research showed that parents were concerned about getting back quickly, so transit pass contains a no cost taxi system to address those concerns for exceptional circumstances, building in safeguards.

Mapping Tools

- Barriers and tools: matching barriers with tools and making it public and durable, close in space and time
 - Barrier lack of motivation: tools of commitment, norms, incentives
 - Barrier of forgetting behavior: prompts
 - Not the right thing to do mentality: establish norms
 - Lack knowledge: communication
 - Inconvenient: structural change
 - Cost: norms, structural change, commitment, status of purchase and visibility
- Can run different tool sets as different pilots
- Can also run several pilots at the same time employing different strategies
- Can combine tool sets like norms with commitments that are part of the same pilot with a two pronged approach

- Use focus groups who are members of the target audience to obtain feedback on strategy before committing to a pilot.
- Once first pilot is undertaken, take a look at the initial results of the program. Do a post pilot survey to tweak strategy to make it even more effective.

Conducting Pilots

- Details
 - want to make sure you are measuring behavior, resource use and resource quality
 - Sample size
 - Random Selection and random assignment!!! Want to know that pilot results are representative of the larger community. If you are planning on a social diffusion or social norms project, people need to be closer to each other, almost have to work with different streets with different conditions.
- Pretest- Posttest (third best method)
 - 1) Pretest- measurements have to be unobtrusive or the program will be skewed
 - 2) Deliver program
 - 3) Posttest
 - 4) Followup
- Intervention and Control (second best)
 - Similar format but with both an intervention and control group
- Staggered Baseline test (Doug's favorite)
 - Often under political pressures to deliver programs broadly, but this is a way to trick the broad scale implementation, so this is a way to stagger the introduction across the community which can be used as a pilot
 - Issues come up with seasonally motivated projects where there can be a long delay in implementing a project after a pilot test. If seasonal, use intervention and control.

Selecting Consultants- most interested in people being able to do all this work for us, also can create a working group to make sure that all components are met

- RFP requirements that indicate how they will:
 - Select Behaviors- should look like combination of impact and probability and how that works.
 - Identify barrier and benefits research once they selected behaviors in first step- talking about triangulation.
 - How would you develop focus groups and surveys- based on literature search etc, identify 2 target audiences, active and non active and multivarious statistics, have sufficient background to do this sort of work.
 - How would they utilize CBSM tool? Trick question, they should not give an answer, they don't have the tools yet because they have not done the research.
 - Design and Implement Pilots
- Contact consultants through universities that specialize in this- social marketing experts or psychologists. Actual program design strategy is the most important focus.